

Bristol City Council Clean Air Plan  
Outline Business Case

Introduction

OBC 3 | 2

October 2019

Bristol City Council

DRAFT

DRAFT

# Introduction

## Contents

<b>Acronyms and Abbreviations .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>1-1</b>
1.1 Overview of Study .....	1-1
1.2 Purpose of this Report .....	1-2
1.3 Structure of this Report .....	1-2

DRAFT

## Acronyms and Abbreviations

ANPR	Automatic Number Plate Recognition
BCC	Bristol City Council
CAF	Clean Air Fund
CAZ	Clean Air Zone
Defra	Department for Environment, Food & Rural Affairs
DfT	Department for Transport
EU	European Union
HGV	Heavy Goods Vehicle
JAQU	Joint Air Quality Unit
LGV	Light Goods Vehicle
NO <sub>2</sub>	Nitrogen Dioxide
OBC	Outline Business Case

DRAFT

# 1. Introduction

## 1.1 Overview of Study

The UK has in place legislation transposing requirements in European Union law, to ensure that certain standards of air quality are met, by setting Limit Values on the concentrations of specific air pollutants. In common with many EU member states, the EU limit value for annual mean nitrogen dioxide (NO<sub>2</sub>) is breached in the UK and there are on-going breaches of the NO<sub>2</sub> limit value in Bristol. The UK government is taking steps to remedy this breach in as short a time as possible, with the aim of reducing the harmful impacts on public health. Within this objective, the government has published a UK Air Quality Plan and a Clean Air Zone Framework, both published in 2017. The latter document provides the expected approach for local authorities when implementing and operating a Clean Air Zone (CAZ).

Due to forecast air quality exceedances, in 2017 Bristol City Council, along with 23 other local authorities, was directed by Her Majesty's Government to produce a Clean Air Plan to achieve air quality improvements in the shortest possible time. In line with Government guidance, as part of the Plan, Bristol City Council has considered a range of options for the implementation of a Clean Air Zone (CAZ), including both charging and non-charging measures, in order to achieve sufficient improvement in air quality and public health and in line with legal requirements as set out below. This process requires the production of a Strategic Outline Case, an Outline Business Case (this report) and a Full business Case, that will be prepared following the Outline Business Case.

Bristol City Council have produced this Outline Business Case (OBC) for the delivery of an option including a package of measures which will be most likely to bring about compliance in line with our legal obligations;

- 1) Achieves compliance with the legal NO<sub>2</sub> limits in the shortest period of time.
- 2) Reduces human exposure as quickly as possible.
- 3) Ensures that compliance is not just possible but likely.

The focus of this Clean Air Plan is on achieving air quality and public health improvements in the shortest time possible in accordance with the High Court Order in November 2016<sup>1</sup>. In the legal case of Client Earth vs the UK Government, Mr Justice Garnham of the High Court found that *'I reject any suggestion that the state can have any regard to cost in fixing the target date for compliance or in determining the route by which the compliance can be achieved where one route produces results quicker than another. In those respects, the determining consideration has to be the efficacy of the measure in question and not their cost. That, it seems to me, flows inevitably from the requirements in the Article to keep the exceedance period as short as possible'*.

Hence the assessment presented within this document focuses on achieving compliance in the shortest possible time, and will only consider cost when comparing between two equally compliant packages of measures.

To support delivery of the Plan, the Joint Air Quality Unit (JAQU) have made three funding streams available:

- Implementation Fund – provided on a needs basis to deliver measures required to achieve compliance with air quality standards in the shortest possible time;
- Clean Air Fund – provided via a competitive bid process, to deliver measures designed to mitigate any adverse distributional impacts expected to fall upon disadvantaged groups (low-income households and businesses in particular);
- Early Measures Fund – provided via a competitive bid process, to support small, ambitious, good value for money and highly deliverable measures that catalyse air quality at an advanced stage. BCC was successful in their Early Measures Fund application and obtained funding for a scheme to incentivise the uptake of electric taxis through various discounts.

<sup>1</sup> November 2016 in R (ClientEarth) (NO<sub>2</sub>) V Secretary of State for Environment Food and Rural Affairs [2016] EWHC 2740 (Admin)

## Introduction

This report focusses on the case for securing Implementation Fund and Clean Air Fund monies to deliver the Plan.

### 1.2 Purpose of this Report

This report sets out the Outline Business Case for the Clean Air Plan, building on the short-listed package of measures identified in the Strategic Outline Case (February 2018), which will bring about compliance with the Limit Value for annual mean NO<sub>2</sub> in the shortest time possible in central Bristol. It has been produced in line with the Inception, Evidence and Options Appraisal packages of Guidance issued by the JAQU in 2017, and the HM Treasury Green Book. It outlines the rationale and justification for securing Implementation Funding and Clean Air Funding from JAQU to deliver the Plan outlined in the OBC.

Following the development of more detailed traffic and air quality modelling as part of the Outline Business Case process, the previously identified shortlist of options has been revisited and taken forward for more detailed assessment to establish a preferred option. This approach is predicated on the requirement to deliver compliance in line with the legal test. Furthermore, through identification of a preferred option, more detailed analysis related to the management, deliverability and affordability of the preferred option are also presented within the Outline Business Case, once again building on the initial findings documented in the Strategic Outline Case.

### 1.3 Structure of this Report

The remainder of this report is structured around the five cases, namely:

- Strategic Case – sets out the case for change and the spending objectives of the Plan
- Economic Case – assesses the compliance year of the options, then considers the shortlisted options from a value for money perspective, as well as identifying distributional impacts of the shortlisted options.
- Commercial Case – establishes the preferred route to procurement, based on supplier capability and likely delivery solution
- Financial Case - sets out the detailed costings for the Plan and available funding sources
- Management Case – provides the governance and management arrangements to deliver the preferred option

These chapters are in turn supported by a comprehensive set of appendices as follows:

- Strategic case supporting documents:
  - Appendix A Scheme Details
  - Appendix Ai Scheme plans
  - Appendix Aii Signage design report
  - Appendix Aiii Boundary change report
  - Appendix Av Flow chart of back office system and data flow/decision process
  - Appendix B Stakeholder Management and Engagement Plan
  - Appendix C Option Assessment Report
  - Appendix Ci Clean Air Fund Proposal
- Economic case supporting documents:
  - Appendix D Air Quality Assessment
  - Appendix Di Methodology Report (AQ2)
  - Appendix Dii Modelling Report (AQ3)
  - Appendix Diii Church Road assessment and 2025 modelling

## Introduction

- Appendix E Transport Modelling Report
- Appendix Ei Model Validation Reports (T2)
- Appendix Eii Methodology Report (T3)
- Appendix Eiii ANPR data analysis
- Appendix Eiv LGV/HGV Validation
- Appendix Ev Response Rates Technical Note
- Appendix Evi Forecasting Report (T4)
- Appendix F Stated Preference Survey Report
- Appendix G Economics Reports
- Appendix Gi Economics Methodology Report (E1)
- Appendix Gii COBALT assessment
- Appendix Giii Economics model (E2)
- Appendix H Distributional Equalities Impacts Assessment (E3)
- Appendix T Environmental assessment report
- Appendix P – Sensitivity test report
- Commercial case supporting documents:
  - Appendix I Procurement Strategy
- Financial case supporting documents:
  - Appendix J Project Costs
  - Appendix Q Finance Report
  - Appendix S Letter from Section 151 Officer
- Management case supporting documents:
  - Appendix K Project Plan
  - Appendix L Risk Management Strategy - Quantified Risk Assessment
  - Appendix M Engagement Report
  - Appendix N Consultation Report
  - Appendix O Monitoring and Evaluation Plan
  - Appendix R Equalities Impact Assessment